

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING

URBANA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED

DATE: July 7, 2010

TIME: 7:00 p.m.

PLACE: City Council Chamber, 400 South Vine Street, Urbana, Illinois

MEMBERS PRESENT: Scott Dossett, Alice Novak, Trent Shepard, Kim Smith, Joan Stolz, Mary Stuart

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Robert Myers, Planning Division Manager; Tony Weck, Recording Secretary

OTHERS PRESENT: Dennis Roberts, George Almasi, Ritchie Drennen, Charles Pettigrew, James Lusk, Ponce Palmer, Mark Jones, DeWayne Blackwell, Catherine Barbercheck, Edward Muldrow, John LeNoir, Glenn Berman, Addie Williams, Estelle Dixon, Cynthia Biggers, Odessa Taylor, Brian Adams, Camilla Fulton, Rev. B.J. Tatum, Albert Williams, Annie Cleveland, Marie S. Polk, Ashley Oaties, Elawrence Davis, Willie J. Granville, Mattie Gray, Leonard Gray, Kenon Johnson, Rev. Anthony Peppers, Rev. Harold Davis, Catherine Deen, Michelle Hill, Earlene Terry, Emanuel J. Terry, Marina S. Sherrill, Jarel Jackson

1. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL AND DECLARATION OF QUORUM

The meeting was called to order at 7:03 p.m. by Historic Preservation Commission Chair, Alice Novak. Roll was taken and a quorum was declared. Ms. Novak noted that Commissioner Art Zangerl had resigned from the Commission. She acknowledged his service on the Commission since its inception. She also acknowledged his dedication to Urbana's historic preservation generally.

2. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

There were none.

3. APPROVAL OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

The Commission reviewed the draft minutes of the June 2, 2010 meeting. Mr. Shepard made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Ms. Stolz seconded the motion. Upon a vote, the Commission unanimously approved the June 2 minutes as presented.

4. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

There were none.

5. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Alice Novak stated that there would be several opportunities to be heard at tonight's meeting. If someone wished to speak on any agenda item they could do so now or wait until the point on the agenda for that specific agenda item. No one in the audience indicated they wished to speak, and Ms. Novak proceeded to the next agenda item.

6. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARINGS

There were none.

7. OLD BUSINESS

There was none.

8. NEW PUBLIC HEARINGS

Case #HP-2010-COA-03, 115 West main Street (Tiernan's Block/Masonic Temple). Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace six windows, R Rentals, applicant.

Ms. Novak asked for the staff report for this agenda item. Mr. Myers presented the staff report to the Commission, outlining staff's findings regarding this case. Based upon this proposed project's adherence to criteria 1, 2 and 3 of Section XII-6.B.2 of the Urbana Zoning Ordinance, City staff recommended that the Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace six windows with the following conditions:

- The replacement windows will be built and installed in general conformance to the application for Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted;
- The replacement windows will be installed with the reveal from the front face of the window framing to the front face of the building to match the existing reveal; and
- The replacement windows will be installed without the two-inch frame expander as shown in the sill drawing unless it is necessary.

Commission questions to City staff were addressed, following which Ms. Novak asked if the applicant in this case wished to address the Commission.

Glenn Berman, the applicant, and Daniel Wells, Wells & Wells Construction addressed the Commission briefly. Both Mr. Berman and Mr. Wells gave general information regarding the application.

Ms. Novak then asked if anyone else in the audience wished to address the Commission. There were no comments or questions from the audience.

The Commission then discussed the case briefly. Following discussion, Mr. Dossett made a motion that the Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness based on the applicant's adherence to Section XII-6.B.2 of the Urbana Zoning Ordinance.

Ms. Smith seconded the motion.

With no further discussion of the case, Ms. Novak asked for a roll call vote. Roll was taken and the votes were as follows:

Dossett	–	Yes	Novak	–	Yes
Shepard	–	Yes	Smith	–	Yes
Stolz	–	Yes	Stuart	–	Yes

With all Commissioners present in favor, the motion carried unanimously and the Certificate of Appropriateness was granted.

With no further discussion, Ms. Novak closed the public hearing for Case #HP-2010-COA-03.

9. NEW BUSINESS

Case #HP-2010-L-02, 104 N. Central Avenue (Eli Halberstadt House): Preliminary Determination for a Historic Landmark Nomination, Brian Adams, Applicant.

Ms. Novak introduced this case and noted that even though this was not an official public hearing there would be an opportunity for anyone in the audience wishing to speak to do so. She clarified that the duty of the Commission at this meeting was to determine whether or not the house at 104 North Central Avenue was eligible for designation as a local historic landmark. A public hearing and Commission recommendation on whether or not to designate the property as a local landmark would occur at a future Commission meeting. She then asked for the City staff report regarding this case. Following this the applicant and property owner representatives would be offered a chance to provide any comments, following which audience members would have the same opportunity.

Mr. Myers presented the staff report to the Commission, outlining staff's findings. Mr. Myers also gave a brief history of the house, noting that it was built by Eli Halberstadt, a grain miller and four-term mayor of Urbana. He also noted that the house was an example of the Italianate and Stick/Eastlake architectural styles built in the 1870s. The house is remarkably intact. Based on Sanborn Fire Insurance maps from the 1890's, it appears that the only change to the house's exterior was to enclose a rear porch. Mr. Myers also highlighted four past historic resource surveys beginning in 1971 which have recognized this property as a significant resource for Urbana.

In terms of qualifications for designation as a local landmark under the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance, City staff recommends the following findings.

- The property located at 104 N. Central Avenue known as the Eli Halberstadt House was constructed in 1875 for prominent milliner and four-term mayor of Urbana Eli Halberstadt in the Italianate and Stick/Eastlake architectural style.

- The Eli Halberstadt House is significant as part of the architectural, civic, cultural, economic, political and social heritage of the community. The property is unique for Urbana because it is an uncommon example of residential Italianate and Stick/Eastlake architectural styles. In addition to its architectural significance, the house also has significant value as it was built by Eli Halberstadt, a prominent businessman and politician who served as mayor of Urbana when Urbana was chosen as the site of the future University of Illinois.
- The Eli Halberstadt House is associated with an important person in local history in that it was built by Eli Halberstadt, a prominent businessman and four-term mayor of Urbana.
- The Eli Halberstadt House is representative of the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type inherently valuable for the study of a period, style, and craftsmanship and retains sufficient integrity. The property is an excellent example of the Italianate and Stick/Eastlake architectural styles and retains a high degree of integrity.
- The Eli Halberstadt House is not known to be the notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, or artist whose individual genius has influenced the area.
- The Eli Halberstadt House is not an identifiable and familiar visual feature in the community owing to its unique location or physical characteristics.
- The Eli Halberstadt House is not a particularly fine or unique example of a utilitarian structure.
- The Eli Halberstadt House is not known to be located in an area that has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.

Based on the application and staff's findings, City staff recommended that the Commission find that 104 North Central Avenue qualifies for designation as a local historic landmark based on Criteria a, b, and c of Section XII-5.C. of the *Urbana Zoning Ordinance*.

Ms. Novak asked if there were any questions from the Commission for Mr. Myers.

There were none.

Ms. Novak then asked if the applicant in this case wished to address the Commission.

The applicant, Brian Adams, briefly addressed the Commission, asking its members to agree that the Eli Halberstadt House qualifies as a local historic landmark. Mr. Adams also gave a brief background on how he came to nominate this particular property.

Ms. Novak then asked if the owner of 104 North Central Avenue wished to address the Commission regarding the nomination.

Catherine Barbercheck, attorney for the property owner, first addressed the Commission.

She stated that she realized the role of the Commission tonight was to review the application under the criteria for designation, but that it's also important for the Commission to know that the building needs a great deal of costly repair work.

Rev. B.J. Tatum, Canaan Baptist Church, next addressed the Commission. He stated that the house unfortunately has been a financial “sinkhole” and the church does not have the funds to make necessary repairs. Designating the property a landmark could take the property out of their control in terms of maintenance standards. The boiler for the hot water heating system failed earlier this year, and they have three cost estimates to replace it ranging between \$18,000 and \$20,000. That’s just for the heating system. Plus the plumbing system is really bad. Only one of the apartments is being occupied at this time, and they are not sure what they will need to happen when the weather turns cold. It is not cost effective for the church to further invest in it. Mr. Dossett commented that in terms of meeting the criteria for landmark designation, the Commission could not consider the external finances or the costs of being a historic landmark.

Ms. Novak then asked if anyone else in the audience wished to address the Commission regarding this case, calling on each section row by row. There were no comments or questions from the audience.

The Commission then discussed the case. Following discussion, Ms. Novak made a motion that the Commission find that 104 North Central Avenue, also known as the Eli Halberstadt House, qualifies for designation as a local historic landmark based on Criteria a, b, and c of Section XII-5.C of the *Urbana Zoning Ordinance*, and based on its significance as an uncommon combination of the Italianate and Stick/Eastlake styles of architecture, its 1870s construction and the fact that it was the residence of Eli Halberstadt, a prominent businessman and four-term mayor of Urbana.

Mr. Dossett seconded the motion.

With no further discussion of the case, Ms. Novak asked for a roll call vote. Roll was taken and the votes were as follows:

Dossett	–	Yes	Novak	–	Yes
Shepard	–	Yes	Smith	–	Yes
Stolz	–	Yes	Stuart	–	Yes

With all Commissioners present in favor, the motion carried unanimously. Ms. Novak noted that the next step in the process was that the case be forwarded to a public hearing to be held by the Commission at its next regular meeting.

10. MONITORING OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES

Regarding the Mumford House, Ms. Novak reported that there was currently no activity. She briefly noted renovations in progress on other historic structures on the University of Illinois campus.

11. STAFF REPORT

Mr. Myers updated the Commission on the status of the Urbana-Lincoln Hotel landmark application. Because the applicant will be unavailable for the Committee of the Whole meeting on July 12, and after consulting with the applicant, the application will be forwarded to the July 26 Committee of the Whole meeting.

Based on Commissioner feedback, it now appears there will not be a quorum for the August Historic Preservation Commission meeting at which the public hearing for the 104 N Central Ave. landmark application would be held. Immediately following adjournment tonight Mr. Myers will poll Commissioners as to their availability for a potential special meeting. City staff will let everyone know as soon as possible when the public hearing would be held.

Mr. Myers was asked how a new Vice Chair should be selected following Art Zangerl's resignation. City staff will consult the Commission's bylaws and work on this issue.

12. STUDY SESSION

There was none.

13. ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were none.

14. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business Mr. Dossett moved that the meeting be adjourned. Mr. Shepard seconded the motion. With all Commission members in favor the meeting adjourned at 8:02 p.m.

Submitted by:

Robert Myers, AICP
Planning Division Manager